

## VU Research Portal

**Review of Stuart Kirsch: Mining Capitalism. The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics. Oakland: University of California Press, 2014. [Review of: S. Kirsch (2014) Mining Capitalism. The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics.]**  
de Theije, M.E.M.

***published in***  
Anthropos  
2015

[Link to publication in VU Research Portal](#)

***citation for published version (APA)***

de Theije, M. E. M. (2015). Review of Stuart Kirsch: Mining Capitalism. The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics. Oakland: University of California Press, 2014. [Review of: S. Kirsch (2014) Mining Capitalism. The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics.]. *Anthropos*, 110(2015/2), 637-637.

**General rights**

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

**Take down policy**

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.

**E-mail address:**  
[vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl](mailto:vuresearchportal.ub@vu.nl)

nial information that is considered to be restricted to initiated male Arrernte and Luritja men makes the prospects for republication in English even less likely.

Despite numerous biographical examinations of the Strehlow family's legacy in Central Australia, "The Aranda's Pepa" is the first manuscript to seriously confront the intellectual foundations of the anthropology pioneered by Carl and later improved upon by his son. While only a minor criticism, I do think that a better positioning of Kenny herself would have enriched the book. As an anthropologist with a great deal of experience in the same region which Strehlow studied, Kenny's own fieldwork insights could have provided excellent context for some of the theoretical issues discussed in part two. This also would have given the reader a better appreciation of how arcane, archival collections can connect with, and impact upon contemporary lives. This observation aside, "The Aranda's Pepa" does an excellent job of examining this impressively rich and under-recognized body of work.

Jason Gibson

**Kirsch, Stuart:** *Mining Capitalism. The Relationship between Corporations and Their Critics.* Oakland: University of California Press, 2014. 328 pp. ISBN 978-0-520-28171-4. Price: \$ 29.95

Mining Capitalism is an inspiring reading of the conflict between local communities and large mining projects, or between environment conservation and economic development as others would say, based on more than two decades of scholarship and activism. Stuart Kirsch is associate professor of Anthropology at the University of Michigan and he studied the indigenous movement of the Yonggom people against the negative impact of the Ok Tedi copper and gold mine in Papua New Guinea.

The mine was developed from 1980 on by the Australian mining company Broken Hill Proprietary Ltd. (BHP) that later, in 2001, merged with the Anglo-Dutch Billiton PLC into BHP Billiton. The Ok Tedi mine is located in the remote area close to the border with the militarized Indonesian territory West Papua. The Papua government also took a stake in the project. At the time, this was seen as an important manner to secure access for the nation to the benefits and development potential of natural resources. However, as Kirsch demonstrates clearly, it also reinforced the fundamental conflict of interest as a shareholder and regulator of the project (22). Thus the stage was set for an enormous environmental degradation of the Ok Tedi River and Fly River and the forest around. Kirsch uses the term "slow-motion disaster" (28), for the damage caused by the discharging of large volumes of tailings containing zinc and lead and other polluting materials and waste rock directly in the rivers. The company and the government long tried ignoring the disaster, but the Yonggom people could not do that. They were losing their livelihood because the river and forest became contaminated with the waste from the mine. "Local landscapes are no longer a site of productivity, but scenes of loss" (41).

In "Mining Capitalism," Kirsch defines his subject as "the relationship between corporations and their crit-

ics" (3) but the picture he draws for us is much more comprehensive than that. The book is an ethnographic suspense of an extremely complex field of different actors and interests. In six chapters, each with a different focus, Kirsch dissects the problem, and also proposes a – be it modest – solution. He starts with the protests (chap. 2) and legal actions (chap. 3) that the critics of the mining industry undertook. Then the focus changes to the other side of the conflict, the mining industry, and how they use and abuse science to manipulate discussions and evade responsibilities (chap. 4), and how a concerted action of the industry promoted mining as a positive contribution to development (chap. 5, called "Industry Strikes Back"). In the last chapter, Kirsch compares strategies deployed by the critics of the mining industry. He shows how the campaign against the Ok Tedi mine was based on politics of space by linking people in many different locations into one network of opposition. This was very important, but in the end it took too much time to stop the pollution. Alternatively, Kirsch proposes there should be a politics of time to raise the consciousness of the people with respect to the impacts of the mining projects in an early phase, "accelerate the learning curve" (192, 211), so that the mobilization will occur before people "concluded that the river was no longer worth saving" (189).

This is an important book for everybody interested in the large-scale exploitation of natural resources in developing countries. I will also recommend it to my students as an example of the role and consequences of engagement and activism in anthropological practice. This book is also a reflection of Kirsch's personal history living, participating, and sharing the effects of the mining project with the people living downstream the mine at Ok Tedi River. The personal involvement of Kirsch in the processes he describes is at times very palpable; the reader feels that there are still bills to settle with some opponents, but after the analysis presented here, that is completely understandable.

Marjo E. M. de Theije

**Knörr, Jacqueline:** *Creole Identity in Postcolonial Indonesia.* New York: Berghahn Books, 2014. 225 pp. ISBN 978-1-78238-268-3. (Integration and Conflict Studies, 9) Price: \$ 90.00

This anthropological research shows a trans-ethnic (urban-oriented) character, where the city itself is not only the spatial reality of the dwellers living there, but also serves them independently of specific regional origins and ethnic affiliations as an object of identification, engagement, and discourse. Jakarta as a postcolonial city established by the Dutch colonizers and a capital and prime city of the country, where the "Western" influences are particularly marked and consisting of over three hundred ethnic groups, offers a wealth of material of interethnic relationships and intercultural interaction.

The first chapter of the book tells about the Creole identity in postcolonial context. Referring to Stewart's theory, the author Jacqueline Knörr points out that the term "Creole" was increasingly applied above all to groups emerging from unions between (former) slaves